
RECOMMENDATIONS TO COMBATING RACISM IN POLICING

Inter-institutional Working Group against Racism in Policing

RECOMMENDATIONS TO COMBATING RACISM IN POLICING

Inter-institutional Working Group against Racism in Policing

COLLEGIAL BODY OF THE 7TH CHAMBER OF COORDINATION AND REVIEW OF THE MPF

José Adonis Callou de Araújo Sá

Associate Federal Prosecutor General - Coordinator

Maria Iraneide Olinda Santoro Facchini

Associate Federal Prosecutor General

ALTERNATES:

Joaquim José de Barros Dias

Associate Federal Prosecutor General

Marcelo de Figueiredo Freire

Federal Circuit Prosecutor

Maria Emília Moraes de Araújo

Associate Federal Prosecutor General

COMPOSITION OF THE INTER-INSTITUTIONAL WORKING GROUP AGAINST RACISM IN POLICING

COORDINATION OF THE GTI

Ela Wiecko V. de Castilho - Coordinator (November 2020)

Retired Associate Federal Prosecutor General (January 2023)

Paulo Gilberto Cogo Leivas - Federal Circuit Prosecutor (from January 2023 to the present)

ORIGINAL MPF MEMBERS

Marcelo de Figueiredo Freire - Federal Circuit Prosecutor

SELECTED MEMBERS OF THE MPF

Eduardo Santos de Oliveira Benones - Federal Prosecutor

Enrico Rodrigues de Freitas - Federal Prosecutor

Gabriel Pimenta Alves - Federal Prosecutor

Júlio José Araújo Júnior - Federal Prosecutor

MEMBERS APPOINTED BY LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCIES AND THE JUSTICE SYSTEM

PF - **Maximiliano Ricardo de Menezes Coimbra** - Archivist, **Nelson Levy Kneip de Freitas Macêdo** - Federal Police Chief

DPRF - **Paris Barbosa** - Federal Highway Police Officer - member, **Liamara Cararo Pires** - Federal Highway Police Officer

– alternate:

DPU - **Thales Arcoverde Treigeis** - Federal Public Defender

SELECTED RESEARCHERS:

Fernanda Barros dos Santos

Jacqueline Sinhoretto

José da Cruz Bispo de Miranda

Mayara Castro de Souza

CIVIL SOCIETY REPRESENTATIVES

INSTITUTO CIDADE SEGURA (Safe City Institute), representative **Tâmara Biolo Soares** - member, **Alberto Kopittke** - alternate

REDE NACIONAL DE MÃES E FAMILIARES DE VÍTIMAS DO TERRORISMO DO ESTADO (National Network of Mothers and Family Members of Victims of Terrorism of the State), representative **Patricia Oliveira** - member, **Priscila Flores Serra** - alternate

EDUCAFRO, representative **Waldilene Priscila Antonio de França**

LUTA PELA PAZ (Fight for Peace), representative **Beatriz Reis** - member, **Brenda Vitória Pacífico** - alternate

INSTITUTO BRASILEIRO DE CIÊNCIAS CRIMINAIS (Brazilian Institute of Criminal Sciences - IBCCrim), representative **Leonardo Palazzi** - head

PERMANENT GUESTS

CSP/CNMP - representative **Alexandre Reis de Carvalho** - Military Prosecutor

SENAPPEN - representative **Jessica Alves da Silva**

ADVISORY SERVICES OF THE 7TH CCR/MPF

Cláudia de Fátima Marques Roque - Executive Secretary

Graciele Barbiero Fagundes Gomide - Chief Coordination Advisor

Elicelma da Silva Lessa de Araújo - Coordination Office

Marjana da Silva Peixoto - Coordination Advisor

Pedro Bezerra da Silva Filho - Coordination Office

Sonia Maria Soares - Coordination Office

Simone Fonseca Soares - Chief Administrative Advisor

PARTICIPATING INSTITUTIONS

Federal Prosecution Service – MPF

Federal Highway Police – PRF

Federal Police - PF

Federal Public Defender's Office - DPU

Instituto Cidade Segura - ICS

Rede Nacional de Mães e Familiares de

Vítimas do Terrorismo do Estado

Educafro

Luta Pela Paz

Instituto Brasileiro de Ciências Criminais - IBCCrim

Prison System Commission - CSP/CNMP

National Secretariat for Penal Policies - Senappen

INTRODUCTION

The Inter-institutional Working Group against Racism in Policing (GTI Racism) was created by Ordinance No. 5 of the 7th Chamber on November 27, 2020 and is linked to the 7th Coordination and Review Chamber (7th CCR). The GTI Racism has the following objectives: identify racism within the scope of federal law enforcement agencies; propose actions and measures to eliminate discriminatory conduct; foster public debate on racism in law enforcement institutions and policing, among others.

The group includes members of the Federal Prosecution Service, researchers on police violence and institutional racism, representatives of civil society organizations (*Luta pela Paz, Instituto Brasileiro de Ciências Criminais, Instituto Cidade Segura, Educafro and Rede Nacional de Mães e Familiares de Vítimas do Terrorismo do Estado*), representatives of the Federal Police and the Federal Highway Police, as well as the Federal Public Defender's Office. The National Council of the Prosecution Service (CNMP) and the National Secretariat for Penal Policies (Senappen) are permanent guests on the GTI.

The GTI Racism work plan was divided into three stages: diagnosis, articulation and recommendations. In the articulation stage, an internal seminar was held in 2021 and 2023, a public hearing in 2022, as well as a Collection of Articles - Racism in Policing was published in 2023.

In the diagnosis stage, data was requested from the Federal Police, the Federal Highway Police and the National Secretariat for Penal Policies, in addition to gathering the work of the Federal Prosecution Service related to the GTI's theme. Based on the review of the data, a **Diagnostic Report** was prepared, divided into three axes: *Axis 1 - Racial and Ethnic Profiling of the Prison and Public Security Systems; Axis 2 - Police Training; and Axis 3 - Anti-Racist Action Protocol.*

The main conclusions of the diagnosis were: lack of data and organizational cultures with no tradition of accountability; male and white police; a slightly more egalitarian criminal police; low capacity to investigate crimes of racism and few charges; absence of anti-racist education in police training activities, which indicates a lack of institutional self-criticism regarding institutional and structural racism; lack of relevant information on issues related to race, ethnicity and gender in the norms reviewed; lack of a specific protocol regarding the production of data or actions in relation to the ethnic-racial issue.

The **Diagnostic Report** can be accessed via the QR Code below:



During the recommendations stage, members of the 7th Coordination and Review Chamber, members of the GTI Racism, representatives of the Federal Police (PF), the Federal Highway Police (PRF), the National Secretariat for Penal Policies (Senappen), as well as representatives of civil society met at the headquarters of the Office of Federal Circuit Prosecution of the 2nd Region, in the city of Rio de Janeiro, for a **Seminar called Racism in Policing: Perspectives and Challenges**.

At the **Racism in Policing: Perspectives and Challenges Seminar**, 43 recommendations were made covering the three axes of the review: Axis 1 - Racial and Ethnic Profiling of the Prison and Public Security Systems ; Axis 2 - Police Training; and Axis 3 - Anti-racist Action Protocol.

The minutes of the Seminar can be accessed via the QR Code below:



43 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR COMBATING RACISM IN POLICING

AXIS 1 - RACIAL AND ETHNIC PROFILING OF THE PRISON AND PUBLIC SECURITY SYSTEMS (10 RECOMMENDATIONS)

1 Send public databases (disaggregated spreadsheets) to the MPF and make them available to the public with information useful for the external control of police action, according to a technical note to be prepared by the 7th Chamber.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

2 Monitor the sending of useful micro-data (disaggregated spreadsheets) for monitoring police actions.

RECEIVER OF THE RECOMMENDATION:

- **The Federal Prosecution Service.**

3 Develop action protocols to improve the production of evidence and identify probable cause in cases of deaths resulting from police actions, including when the federal police act jointly with other forces, with the aim of inhibiting the abusive use of force.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

4 Identify individuals involved in deaths resulting from police intervention and recurrent use of force (identify recurrence).

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

5 Recommend ethnic-racial equity in the composition of civil servants' careers, in management positions and within the relationship with the public in general when carrying out their actions.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

- 6** Federal police institutions must improve their protocols for investigating crimes of racism, racial insult and torture.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

- 7** Create a database of good practices (pleadings, actions, rulings...) and make them widely available to MPF members.

RECEIVER OF THE RECOMMENDATION:

- **The Federal Prosecution Service.**

- 8** Hold an event with the aim of deepening knowledge on topics such as investigating killings resulting from policing, crimes related to racism and controlling the storage of images from video surveillance and facial recognition devices.

RECEIVER OF THE RECOMMENDATION:

- **The Federal Prosecution Service.**

Police organizations must create and maintain protocols and routines for collecting, storing and making available data on police actions and indicators that promote transparency and accountability.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

10 Police organizations must create, maintain and make publicly available the databases (disaggregated spreadsheets) with information useful to the external control of police actions.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

AXIS 2 - POLICE TRAINING (19 RECOMMENDATIONS)

- 1** Create a permanent forum with the MPF, the PF, the PRF, the Senappen, government agencies and members of civil society interested in taking part in it, for monitoring combat against racism in policing with the aim to debate and coordinate the implementation of all the recommendations approved in the final report.

RECEIVER OF THE RECOMMENDATION:

- **The Federal Prosecution Service.**

- 2** Make the idea of creating the forum public as a strategy for engaging civil society.

RECEIVER OF THE RECOMMENDATION:

- **The Federal Prosecution Service.**

- 3** Balance the workload and number of courses focused on human rights and humanistic education with courses dedicated to transmitting techniques for the use of force and others defined as "operational".

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

4 Reformulate course contents of subjects related human rights in order to effectively address the issue of institutional reproduction of racism and other forms of structural discrimination within the police, including discrimination and prejudices such as misogyny, homotransphobia, ableism and fatphobia.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

5 Qualify the teaching staff through specific courses on combating racism and other structural discrimination, in order to allow a transversal approach to these issues in all subjects and minimize the reproduction of such discrimination in the attitudes and behavior of teachers.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

6 Strengthen and encourage the mainstreaming of human rights in all police training activities.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

7 Strengthen the subject of Human Rights as an autonomous content that addresses the various types of structural discrimination that shape Brazilian society and generate various types of vulnerability, among which racism stands out.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

8 Establish a minimum workload in the subject of human rights and anti-racism education and other structural discrimination in all police institutional courses, whether they are for initial training or professional specialization.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

- 9** Dedicate resources to research the relation between the hidden curriculum and the maintenance of racial selectivity in policing.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

- 10** Promote participation of members of the Prosecution Service and civil society as guest instructors and observers in police training activities.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

- 11** Create police training management committees, with the participation of organized civil society, the Prosecution Service, universities and groups dedicated to public security research.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

12 Ensure that Human Rights training is not restricted to tackling crimes against human rights.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

13 Carry out activities in such a way as to make police officers listen directly and constantly to vulnerable populations, such as indigenous peoples and *quilombolas* (Afro-Brazilian communities who were formed by runaway slaves during the time of slavery in Brazil), community dwellers, LGBTQIA+, the homeless population, prisoners, former inmates, without increasing in any way their vulnerability.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

14 Promote the elimination of the use of stigmatizing and discriminatory language by police officers, encouraging the adoption of non-violent communication.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

15 Implement, as a matter of urgency, academic management systems that enable data transparency, in order to demonstrate compliance with the recommendations of this working group.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

16 Incorporate the issue of police training into the external control of police activities carried out by the Prosecution Service, including with a view to monitoring the implementation of the recommendations of the GTI Racism in Policing.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

17 Recommend that the Higher School of the Prosecution Service (ESMPU) develop and offer specific courses on human rights, and other types of structural discrimination as well as anti-racist education for teachers in the various areas of police knowledge.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

18 The MPF should prepare a technical note on the practical application of the recommendations contained in items 3 to 17.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

19 Promote a national campaign to multiply anti-racist vocabulary: "Language is everything, those who speak consent".

RECEIVER OF THE RECOMMENDATION:

- **The Federal Prosecution Service.**

AXIS 3 - ANTI-RACIST ACTION PROTOCOL (14 RECOMMENDATIONS)

- 1** Prepare a technical note in respect to the cultural identity of black people in prison, such as haircuts and body religious rites.

RECEIVER OF THE RECOMMENDATION:

- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

- 2** Add to the external control forms questions about the ethnic-racial profile of the people approached and caught in the act.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Prosecution Service**
- **The National Council of the Prosecution Service.**

- 3** Recommend that the notices and regulations about public selections and the internal rules of police institutions do not incur in any kind of discrimination, such as those related to body and hair characteristics of police officers.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

4 Create a database with an ethnic-racial profile by types of crime.

RECEIVER OF THE RECOMMENDATION:

- **The Federal Police.**

5 Prohibit all racial/ethnic profiling in approaches, searches, arrests and detentions in flagrante delicto, and request that police officers justify their suspicions.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway police.**

6 In order to avoid ethnic-racial profiling, it is essential that, when detention in flagrante delicto takes place, as well as when the testimony of the suspects is taken, the police authority - and the member of the Prosecution Service, at the custody hearing - question the reasons for the initial approach to the suspect and record it in writing.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Federal Prosecution Service;**
- **The Federal Police.**

- 7** Make it possible to survey the ethnic-racial, gender identity, religion and sexual orientation profile of the people approached and arrested, with the mandatory inclusion of data relating to this profile in the institution's systems, preferably by self-declaration.

RECEIVER OF THE RECOMMENDATION:

- **The Federal Highway police.**

- 8** Create a database in the ombudsman's office on complaints of mistreatment of people in prison with an ethnic-racial and religious focus, as well as a database of complaints of racism in the prison environment.

RECEIVER OF THE RECOMMENDATION:

- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

- 9** Create a consolidated national database with information on the initiation of internal disciplinary procedures (IDPs) based on race and color, gender identity, religion and sexual orientation.

RECEIVER OF THE RECOMMENDATION:

- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

10 Include the identification of the religious profile in the prison system database.

RECEIVER OF THE RECOMMENDATION:

- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

11 Guarantee that people in prison who practice religions of African origin have access to freedom of worship and religious assistance, on equal terms with other religious denominations.

RECEIVER OF THE RECOMMENDATION:

- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

12 Adopt minimum routines for storing (chain of custody), accessing and making available images, including to victims and their families, recorded by body cameras, keeping the records for at least a year in a public management environment (cloud).

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Ministry of Justice and Public Security;**
- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

- 13** Adopt a protocol that determines the uninterrupted use of body cameras by agents, during the required activity, and that they are kept attached to the uniform in a place that allows the effective recording of the occurrence, preventing the investigation of liability due to improper use.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Ministry of Justice and Public Security;**
- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**

- 14** In the case of police killings, the images should be preserved regardless of request by the Prosecution Service, the victims or their families, and mechanisms should be created for evaluating the images of incidents.

RECEIVERS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS:

- **The Ministry of Justice and Public Security;**
- **The Federal Police;**
- **The Federal Highway Police;**
- **The National Secretariat for Penal Policies.**



PRF



SENAPPEN



IBCCRIM



CONSELHO NACIONAL DO MINISTÉRIO PÚBLICO

MPF
Ministério Público Federal